

1 Policy Transfer: An Analysis of the Implementation of 2 E-Government Reform Strategies by the Nigeria Immigration 3 Service

4 Dr. Lucky Benson¹ and Mr. Markus Yohana Kamale²

5 ¹ Adamawa State University

6 *Received: 13 April 2021 Accepted: 3 May 2021 Published: 15 May 2021*

7 **Abstract**

8 Policy transfer has been the dominant approach by donors to domestic policy development in
9 less developed countries across Africa. Arguably, countries in the global north have been the
10 main sources and triggers of public sector reforms to Africa. Many of the reforms, were
11 inspired by the ideas of New Public Management (NPM) and e-government strategies. The
12 nature of the transfer has been partly imposed due to loan, debt relief, and technological
13 dependence on the global north by the Nigerian Government. The donors that trigger such
14 transfers in many cases ignored the domestic contextual factors and the critical role of Street-
15 Level-Bureaucrates in policy implementation in developing countries. But the use of
16 conditions by donors to impose policy on African governments may not necessarily lead to the
17 expected outcomes of policy implementation. The Nigeria Immigration Service was used as an
18 empirical case in this research. The data for this study was collected through the use of
19 in-depth interviews with relevant governmental and non-governmental policy actors and
20 documentary sources.

23 **Index terms**— e-government, policy, policy transfer.

24 **1 Introduction**

25 Policy making is no longer an exclusive right of the national governments in less developed countries. Policy
26 ideas and public sector reform strategies are in many cases sourced outside the continent. The reforms are
27 inspired by the ideas of new public management and e-government strategies. New Public Management (NPM)
28 and e-government strategies originated mainly from the European countries and the USA in the global north.
29 Evidence from this study reveals that the domestic policy actors recognised the challenges of service delivery
30 in the 21st Century and identified the need for global solutions to the problems with no evidence that such
31 global solutions can address domestic peculiar challenges in Nigeria. The financial aid, loan and technological
32 dependence of Nigeria on the global north made international donor organisations to be the major triggers of such
33 policy transfers. Consequently, the transfer of internationally formulated solutions to Nigeria has been mainly
34 conditional rather than voluntary adoption of new innovations by Nigerian policy actors.

35 In most cases, the transfers were based on the number of policy assumptions. These include: that Nigerian
36 government would effectively implement such reforms for fear of losing the much needed financial aids, loans, and
37 technical assistance that come as a condition for reform acceptance. This is in line with the argument that a "??
38 political leader in a Third World country has little alternative but to accept the policies imposed by the World
39 Bank or the IMF given that the consequences of refusal are deepening debt and economic and, probably, political
40 crisis" ??Dolowitz and Marsh, 1996:245). This makes donors the major triggers and agents of policy transfer
41 and public sector reforms from the international arena to Nigeria, a less developed country in Africa. But as this
42 study demonstrates, the use of conditions to enforce policy transfer from the international arena to Nigeria may

3 THEORETICAL AND CONCEPTUAL FRAMEWORK A) POLICY TRANSFER

43 not necessarily lead to the expected outcomes of the implementation of the adopted reform strategies. This is so
44 because the domestic factors and local policy actors not international donors implement public sector reforms in
45 Nigeria.

46 The second assumption is that local contextual factors are suitable for the implementation of the internationally
47 formulated policy solutions in Nigeria. This assumption makes international policy actors to overlook the domestic
48 contextual factors, and coerce the political office holders to adopt reforms without considering local factors like
49 culture, availability of infrastructure, and other critical domestic policy actors like the willingness of the ordinary
50 citizens to accept new reforms before the adoption. This paper argues that the effective roll-out of public sector
51 reform strategies from the international arena is not an automatic process even when conditions were attached to
52 such transfers. This is the case because country's specific infrastructures, political commitment, and the citizens'
53 acceptance of new reforms are necessary conditions for the effective roll-out of reform strategies in Nigeria.

54 The questions that guided the study are: i. From where did e-government reform strategies originate to the
55 Nigeria Immigration Service?

56 ii. What were the causes and the modalities used for the transfer? iii. What factors constrained the effective
57 implementation of the e-government reform strategies in the Nigeria Immigration Service?

58 The paper uses the case of e-government reform strategies in Nigeria Immigration Service and examined the
59 dynamics of the effective implementation of policy transfer in Nigeria. It explores the origin, the actors involved
60 and the factors that shaped and determined the effective roll-out of public sector reforms in Nigeria.

61 2 II.

62 3 Theoretical and Conceptual Framework a) Policy Transfer

63 In the original literature of policy transfer, Dolowitz and Marsh defined policy transfer as "?a process in which
64 knowledge about policies, administrative arrangements, institutions etc. in one time and /or place is used in the
65 development of policies, administrative arrangements and institutions in another time and/or place" (1996:344).
66 Arguably, in less developed countries across Africa, the sources of solutions to the problems of service delivery
67 have been not only across their national boundaries but also outside their continent. Countries in the global north
68 have been the major sources of transfer of public sector reform strategies to improve service delivery in Africa.
69 The extant literature has acknowledged that between 1980s and 2000, governments and donors in developed
70 countries placed high priorities on policy transfer to domestic policy making especially in Africa (Azeez, Abidoye,
71 Adesina, Agbale, & Oyewole, 2012; Heeks, 2002a; Karyeija, 2012). The reforms were inspired by the ideas of
72 NPM and the use of e-government strategies to change the change structure of governments work and the
73 delivery of public services in the continent. The reforms include privatisation of public enterprises, deregulation,
74 downsizing, devaluation of local currencies among other examples. The major targets of those reforms are to
75 improve efficiency in governance, and economy and effectiveness in the delivery of public goods and services
76 across Africa. E-government is considered by international donors and domestic political policy actors as a key
77 tool to deliver on the targets of increase efficiency, economy, accountability and transparency across Africa.

78 However, the transfers of those reform ideas from the donor countries mostly in the global north to less
79 developed countries across Africa are in most cases not voluntary, they are conditional and sometimes coercive.
80 Even though the extant literature suggests that public sector reforms across Africa were mostly motivated by
81 the local demand for change and the desire by local governments to emulate international reforms; this study
82 argues that donors in most cases take advantage of African economic and political crises, use financial aids
83 and loan conditionality to transfer internationally formulated solutions to many African countries. The use of
84 conditionality and coercive measures like military might have long become the major determinants of policy
85 transfer and public sector reforms across Africa (Mkandawire & Soludo, 1999; Therkildsen & Development, 2001).
86 But there are limits to how far the transfer of Western ideas can be effectively implemented in Africa even when
87 conditions are attached to enforce policy transfer and public sector reforms. This is mostly due to the variations
88 in the availability of basic infrastructures, citizens' willingness to accept new reforms and the commitments by
89 local policy actors to implement reforms that originated from the global north. Thus, despite the transfer of NPM
90 reform ideas to some countries across Africa, many of those reforms still remain interesting propositions that are
91 not mostly implemented, or at best poorly executed especially in Nigeria (Antwi, Analoui, & Nana-Agyekum,
92 2008; Tambulasi, 2011). Many of the e-government reform strategies have failed to deliver on the original targets
93 of their transfer from the international arena to Nigeria.

94 This study uses the multilevel frameworks of policy transfer as a core analytical element to understand the
95 dynamics of the transfer and the implementation of e-government strategies from the international to Nigeria.
96 The framework draws on Evans and Davies (1999) and Dolowitz and Marsh (2000) multilevel approach to policy
97 transfer. The framework identified national and international policy actors and the role they play in domestic
98 policy development through policy transfer in Nigeria. By way of definition, the multilevel framework of policy
99 transfer is a term used to describe how the domestic policy-makers and the international interest groups find
100 themselves negotiating policy agenda that leads to policy transfer across national boundaries (Evans, 2004; Hague,
101 Harrop, & McCormick, 2016). Here, the authority and policymaking influence are shared across different levels
102 of government: subnational, national, and supranational (Gualini, 2004; Hague et al., 2016). But instead of using
103 the international level, the macro-level and the inter-organizational level as Evans and Davies did, this paper uses

104 the subnational, national, and international levels of government as Gualini (2004) used in his study with some
105 modifications. This study argues that the international policy arena and actors and the national policy actors
106 and factors are important in the effective implementation of public sector reforms in across developing countries
107 where Nigeria is situated. By using this approach, the researcher hopes to not only identify specific countries in
108 the international arena where e-government strategies were transferred to Nigeria but also the pressures for the
109 transfer, and the critical factors that determined the outcomes of effective implementation the reforms.

110 The paper treats policy transfer and the outcomes of the transfer as dependant variables. The transfer depends
111 on certain pressures for reforms, and the effective roll-out of the reforms depends on the local contextual factors
112 and the actions of the domestic policy actors in Nigeria that influence the outcomes of reforms implementation.
113 This is the case because if one attempts to use policy transfer to explain effective policy outcomes, then one
114 also needs to explain the reasons for transfer (Dolowitz & Marsh, 1996). Although the transfer of e-government
115 reform strategies to Nigeria was successful, the outcomes of the transfer in terms of online service delivery,
116 increase efficiency, transparency and the general reduction in the cost of governance have not been as successful
117 as expected in the country. To explain the reasons for the poor implementation of the adopted reform programmes
118 in Nigeria, it would be better to trace the origin of the transfer, the actors involved, the causes of the transfer and
119 the critical factors and actors that determine the effective outcomes of the transfer in country. This is meaningful
120 given the position of Nigeria in both global and African egovernment ranking by the United Nations between
121 2001 and 2020.

122 **4 b) E-government**

123 There are various approaches to understanding the meaning of e-government, where there is convergence within
124 the literature. E-government means the use of the Internet, website, computers, and any interconnected system
125 that is used in the automatic acquisition, storage, sharing of data and delivery of information and services (United
126 Nations, 2018). These technologies are powerful and fast, and have the potential to make sizeable savings in data
127 and reduce both human and material cost of governance across national boundaries (King & Crewe, 2013). Even
128 though many policy actors in the global south see egovernment reforms as the installations of table computers and
129 laptops in public offices, it is evident that e-government is more than mere putting of computers into government
130 offices. It is the use of new technologies driven by the Information and Communication Technologies (ICT)
131 innovations to transform the delivery of information and services, minimise physical contact in service delivery,
132 and reduction in human and material costs of governance especially in Less Developed C (LDC).

133 Although e-government involves many applications and incorporates virtually all ICT platforms, the Internet
134 is the major driver of the use of egovernment reform strategies in both the global north and the global south.
135 The internet has changed the way citizens and business organisations interact with their governments across
136 national boundaries especially in the global north. Just like the personal computer, the Internet has become an
137 indispensable tool in governance in general and provision of online information and service delivery in particular.
138 Governments across Africa as their counterparts in other parts of the World have created websites to provide
139 information about their policies, programmes, goods and services online. It is expected that the adoption
140 of egovernment reforms by governments would also facilitate easy, cheap, fast and a more convenient way of
141 interaction between government and the citizens, government and businesses, government and government and
142 between government and their other clients online (Homburg, 2008;Mundy & Musa, 2010;Nyundo, 2013).

143 To successfully implement e-government reforms, the career public servants and the ordinary citizens who are
144 critical stakeholders in reform implementation must be willing to accept new reforms. Basic infrastructures like
145 stable electricity supply, personal security and safety, personal computers and laptops must be available and
146 affordable to all who would like to own them. But it appears that these critical issues in most cases have not
147 been considered prior to the transfer of e-government reform strategies from the international arena to Nigeria
148 as in many other African countries. This partly explains the reasons why in the global south where Nigeria
149 is situated, the implementation of e-government strategies has not been as successful as hoped for especially
150 by the international donors that used conditionality to coerce governments in the global south to reform. For
151 instance, countries like Somalia, Chad, South Sudan, and Democratic Republic of Congo were ranked at the
152 bottom of global e-government ranking by the UN. These are countries with extreme poverty, poor electricity
153 supply and Internet connectivity, and are politically and economically unstable countries. These conditions have
154 the potentials to affect the successful roll-out of e-government reforms in the aforementioned countries. Apart
155 from five countries namely: Mauritius ranked 1 st in Africa and 58 th globally, and Tunisia ranked second in
156 Africa and 72 nd globally. Others are South Africa 3 rd in Africa but 76 th in the world, Morocco 4 th in Africa
157 and 85 th in the world, and Seychelles 5 th in Africa and 86 th in the world. All other Africa countries including
158 Nigeria were placed in the lower two tiers of egovernment capacity: medium and minimal egovernment capacities
159 (UN e-government Survey, 2018). The position of Africa in global e-government ranking can be attributed to the
160 limited technological infrastructure, poverty, and inadequate human capacity, political instability, local currency
161 devaluation, and poor personal security and safety.

162 The UN e-government survey report ranked Nigeria fifth in Africa behind South Africa, Djibouti, Gabon,
163 and Cote d'Ivoire. The country was placed among the countries with a minimal e-government capacity in the
164 World. Thirteen years later, in 2014 to be precise; the United Nations e-government survey 2014 placed Nigeria
165 in the middle of the top 20 countries in Africa and 141 in the world respectively (United Nations e-government

9 DISCUSSION OF FINDINGS A) THE ORIGIN OF E-GOVERNMENT REFORM IN NIGERIA IMMIGRATION SERVICE (NIS)

166 survey report, 2014). This means that Nigeria is ranked behind countries like Egypt, Morocco, Mauritius, and
167 South Africa. The position of Nigeria in the global and Africa e-government ranking by the UN has deteriorated
168 considerably over the years. Nigeria is not among the top 20 countries in e-government ranking in Africa according
169 to the 2016 United Nations egovernment survey reports (United Nations egovernment Survey Report, 2016). The
170 country is again ranked behind countries like Egypt, Morocco, Kenya, Mauritius, South Africa, and Kenya. This
171 is certainly not the best position for Nigeria. Given that the country earns huge amount of revenue from the
172 sales of crude oil, and is the biggest economy in Africa. The claims by government that e-government reforms
173 have been successfully implemented has been contested by the empirical evidence from this study and the factors
174 responsible for the not successful outcomes of egovernment reform strategies have been identified and discussed.

175 5 III.

176 6 Research Design and Methods

177 A case study research design was used for this study. The theoretical assumptions about policy transfer and
178 their influence on the paper's research questions justified the choice of a case study research design. A case study
179 research design enables the researcher "?to gain insight into the world of several groups of stakeholders?discover
180 the world as seen by participants in the system, and try to explain why they see it this way" ??Swanborn,
181 2010:23). The strength of case study research design lies in its ability to deal with a variety of evidences such
182 as documents, and interviews from multiple sources. This design also "?benefits from the prior development of
183 theoretical propositions to guide data collection and analysis" ??Yin, 2013:17). It is an in-depth investigation
184 from multiple sources and perspectives of research participants that provides in-depth understanding of a specific
185 phenomenon under investigations.

186 Two different qualitative methods of data collection were used to generate the necessary data for this paper.
187 The use of different qualitative methods of data collection is also for triangulation purposes. Triangulation
188 is important to ensure reliability, and validity of the data due to subjectivity and limitations that may be
189 associated with the use of only one tool of data collection (Tambulasi, 2011;Yin, 2009). The qualitative methods
190 of data collection used in this study were interviews with different categories of the research subjects, and the
191 documentary sources. The documentary sources include government and the United Nations publications on
192 e-government reforms in Nigeria. The primary data were generated with the use of in-depth interviews with 3
193 officials of Nigeria Immigration Service (NIS), 2 officials of World Bank, 3 academics, 2 representatives of Peoples
194 Democratic Party (PDP), 1 official of All Progressive Congress (APC) and 2 policy experts respectively.

195 7 a) The Empirical Case Study: Nigeria Immigration Service

196 The Nigeria Immigration Service (NIS) was established as an agency of government responsible for immigration
197 matters in 1958 prior to political independence in 1960. The agency is one of the paramilitary agencies under
198 the Federal Ministry of Internal Affairs. Its mandates is the control of the people coming into or leaving the
199 country. The agency issues passport to Nigerians in and outside the country and residence permits to foreigners in
200 Nigeria (Nigeria Immigration Service, 2017:2). Prior to the introduction of the egovernment reforms at the NIS,
201 the Nigeria passport was a handwritten document. Service delivery then requires physical contacts between the
202 officials of the Nigeria Immigration Service and the service consumers. All payments were made on the Counter
203 and in some designated banks across the country (Olatokun & Abduldayan, 2014).

204 A number of problems associated with this manual service delivery were identified by the research participants.
205 These include multiple issuances of passport, weak security features the passport, and identity theft. Others
206 included the delay in service delivery, difficulties in accessing immigration related information, diversion of
207 government revenue, ghost workers and lack of efficiency and accountability in service delivery. There are
208 participants who suggested that a desire to solve these problems in line with the global best practices led
209 to the transfer of different egovernment initiatives to the NIS. Others emphasised that the pressure from the
210 international community was more responsible for policy transfer to Nigeria. In this regard, the paper identifies
211 two broader causes of the transfer of e-government reforms to the NIS. The domestic demand for change and the
212 external pressure for the transfer of e-government reformstrategies to Nigeria. Consequently, the e-government
213 reforms implemented at the NIS include: the Machine Readable Passport, Electronic Passport, the creation of
214 the official websites to have online presence and the use of the Internet to deliver information and services to the
215 target audience.

216 IV.

217 8 Findings

218 9 Discussion of Findings a) The Origin of E-government Reform 219 in Nigeria Immigration Service (NIS)

220 This section presents a discussion of findings from the empirical case study on the origin of egovernment reform
221 strategies implemented in (NIS). The aim is to answer the study's first research question that is from where did
222 e-government reform strategies originate to Nigeria?

223 Through the study of one empirical case, this paper reveals that the e-government reform strategies
224 implemented in Nigeria originated from countries in both global north and the global South. These countries
225 include the UK, USA, Canada, France, New Zealand, Germany, China, India, Bangladesh and Pakistan. This
226 is not surprising given that many of the so-called solutions originated outside African continent. These include
227 liberal democracy, New Public Management reforms and the latest being the e-government strategies adopted
228 across different Ministries and agencies of government. This is in line with the policy transfer framework developed
229 by Dolowitz and Marsh that international arena is the common source of policy transfer among nation states
230 (Dolowitz & Marsh, 2000;Evans, 2004). Governments can transfer from either the national or the subnational
231 levels. This is also in line with the theoretical framework developed for this study where it is argued that the
232 international arena is the source of e-government reforms implemented in Nigeria. The finding is also supported
233 by the argument in the extant literature that e-government initiatives have already arrived in Africa as imported
234 reform concepts based on imported design ??Benson, 2018 ??&s, 2002:97).

235 Prior to the transfer of e-government strategies to Nigeria, domestic policy actors "travelled to the UK, Canada,
236 India, China and the US before writing the first draft of National Policy on e-government reforms" (Policy expert
237 01). The e-government strategies include the Machine Readable Passport (MRP), e-passport, epayment, the
238 Internet, and the establishment of official websites. They were transferred mainly from Western Countries in the
239 global north and some countries like China, India, Pakistan in the global South to Nigeria.

240 **10 b) The Actors Involved in the Transfer**

241 The majority of the participants in this study have identified domestic policy actors and the international donors
242 as the agents of the transfer of egovernment strategies from the global north to the NIS. The domestic actors
243 involved in the transfer are the senior civil servants of the Nigeria Immigration Service

244 **11 Global Journal of Management and Business Research**

245 Volume XXI Issue III Version I Year 2021 () G (NIS), politicians and policy experts. However, international
246 donors were considered by the research participants' to be the major policy actors that initiated the transfer of
247 e-government reforms to Nigeria. The findings of this study revealed that the donors involved in the transfer are
248 the International Civil Aviation Organisation (ICAO), the European Union and the World Bank. This finding
249 agrees with the original literature of policy transfer by Dolowitz and Marsh where they identified international
250 organisations and donor agencies as agents of policy transfer (Dolowitz & Marsh, 1996;Dolowitz & Marsh, 2000).

251 The extant literature acknowledges that donor organisations and financial institutions have been in many cases
252 responsible for the transfer of New Public Management reform strategies from the global north to the global south
253 (Heeks, 2002b;Tambulasi, 2011;Tettey, 2001;Therkildsen & Development, 2001). Although the study reveals that
254 both domestic and international policy actors were involved in the transfer of e-government reform strategies to
255 Nigeria, majority of the research participants claimed that donors were more responsible for the transfer than
256 the domestic policy actorsbecause of the modalities used for the transfer.

257 **12 c) The Modalities Used for the Transfer**

258 There were different opinions on the modalities used by both domestic policy actors and the international donors
259 for the transfer of e-government strategies to the NIS. However, a common view amongst those opinions was
260 identified. The majority of the participants remarked that conference, workshops were used as modalities by
261 policy actors to transfer egovernment initiatives to Nigeria. Others are the financial support by donors to Nigeria,
262 case study visits by local policy actors to countries that have implemented those reforms, and the condition for
263 acceptance into ICAO board membership. These conditions were used by donors to transfer e-government
264 reform strategies to NIS. Donors offer technical assistance to the NIS in different fields. These include providing
265 consultants who advised the NIS in diverse areas including e-government reforms, and sharing experience of other
266 developed countries with the staff of the NIS.

267 Donors like the ICAO and the Korean Institute for Development Strategy gave financial support to government
268 officials to attend training, workshops and conferences within and outside the country on Epassport reform
269 and the establishment of the online present. When government officials attend such conferences and formal
270 academic training especially in the area of ICT, they usually write report on their return. They make some
271 policy recommendations to the government to implement in line with what they have learnt, and of course based
272 on donors policy prescriptions.

273 Due to Nigeria's dependence on the global north for financial aid, loans, and technology transfer, conditions
274 were used to enforce the transfer of the MRP, e-passport, and the internet reforms introduced in the NIS. One
275 such condition by the ICAO was that Nigeria must adopt the use of E-passport as a condition for admittance
276 into its Board. The country accepted, introduced e-passport reform and became the only African country in
277 the Board of ICAO in 2009. This is in line with Dolowitz and Marsh framework of conditional policy transfer
278 (see Dolowitz & Marsh, 1996;Evans, 2004). Even though, government officials described it as a voluntary policy
279 transfer, evidence above suggests that it was a clear case of conditional rather than voluntary policy transfer.
280 Supra-national institutions like the World Bank, IMF and EU have played a crucial role in the spread of Western
281 monetary policies to Third World countries. Although, the IMF or World Bank loans may appear cheaper for

15 E) THE CONSTRAINTS FOR THE EFFECTIVE ROLL-OUT OF EGOVERNMENT STRATEGIES IN NIGERIA

282 developing countries, in return these donors stipulate certain reform initiatives that have to be implemented if
283 the loan is to be granted to those countries in need ??Dolowitz and Marsh, 1996:348).

284 The donors also used experience sharing as a mechanism for the transfer. They mostly did that by discussing
285 the benefits of such reforms and their achievements in many countries in the global north with the local policy
286 actors in the developing country. This modality was effectively used in the transfer of epassport, the internet
287 and website reforms in Nigeria. The donors recommended and made some financial contributions for government
288 officials to visit mostly developed countries to learn from their experience and to transfer the reform ideas to
289 Nigeria. This was possible because political leaders in many countries in the global south have little but to accept
290 the public sector ideas suggested by the World Bank or IMF given that the result of non-acceptance are likely
291 deepening economic and political crisis (see Dolowitz and Marsh 1996). This study reveals that e-government
292 reforms were used by the ICAO, the World Bank, and the EU as a condition for technical and financial support
293 for Nigerian government. This finding supports the argument that when aid agencies are making loans, organising
294 conferences and sharing experiences, they are likely to lead to conditional policy transfer especially in the third
295 world countries (Dolowitz & Marsh, 2000;Evans, 2004).

296 13 d) The Causes of the Transfer

297 Although Nation States strive for more efficient and better ways of delivery public services, findings from this
298 study revealed that international pressure has been the major driver for the adoption of e-passport reform at the
299 Nigeria Immigration Service. These international pressures are discussed below.

300 14 The International Pressure for Transfer

301 Pressure from the international community often leads to policy transfer and public sector reforms especially
302 from the global north to Africa. The international arena is a field that serves as a source of policy transfer and
303 home that accommodate donors that influence policy transfer across Africa. The participants in this study belief
304 that the actual pressure that led to the transfer of e-government strategies to NIS came from the international
305 community. They argued that the use of conditions for financial assistance by the World Bank, the European
306 Union, and for admission into the board of the ICAO were the major causes for the transfer of egovernment
307 reforms to the NIS. This is the case because:

308 The more donor dependant a nation is, the less likely it is to set its own agenda behind which donor efforts
309 can be aligned. That is why in most cases, donors dictate the agenda for reforms. Poverty has robbed our policy
310 actors of their self-confidence, and self-esteem. It has made them to allow donors to dictate policy prescriptions
311 to them even when those donors lack the sufficient knowledge of the local environment (Policy Expert 02, 2017).

312 A similar argument was made by another participant that:

313 It is a global best practice that is also in line with the International Civil Aviation Organisation standards of
314 operations. It was a condition for admittance into the Board of ICAO. That is why in due recognition of Nigeria
315 Immigration Services stride the ICAO, the global body that regulates standards for travel documents admitted
316 Nigeria into its Board as the sole African representative in 2009 (Government official 04).

317 The international donor organisations took advantage of the hierarchical international aid regimes to transfer e-
318 government strategies to Nigeria. Studies have revealed that subtle coercive pressure and the use of conditions by
319 donors led to policy transfer especially from the global north to the global south (Dolowitz & Marsh, 1996;Evans,
320 2004;. Many of the interviewees considered donors as the major triggers of public sector reforms in Nigeria
321 despite acknowledging the involvement of local policy actors in the process of the transfer. This is in line with
322 the argument in the extant literature that conditional transfer occurs when the international policy arena contains
323 agents powerful enough to impose best practices on nation states (Dolowitz & Marsh, 1996;Evans, 2004).

324 Another important issue that emerged from the interviews was the argument by the participants that donors
325 also get good returns on their policy proposals and reform strategies when they transfer them to Nigeria. They
326 noted that that has been the motivation on the part of the donor agencies to continue to introduce new reform
327 strategies to the Nigeria government, and use conditions to enforce acceptance in the country.

328 15 e) The Constraints for the Effective Roll-out of Egovernment 329 Strategies in Nigeria

330 Many of the participants argued that the government's e-government strategies implemented at the Nigeria
331 Immigration Service have not been as successful as they should have been. The majority of the respondents
332 attributed the failure of e-government reforms at the Nigeria Immigration service to a number of factors. These
333 include the high cost of e-government strategies and their implications on national security. Others are the poor
334 electricity supply and Internet connectivity, low level of ICT skill and high rate of poverty, and corruption in
335 governance. The majority of the interviewees across all the five categories of the research participants identified
336 the aforementioned factors as the major constraint to the effective roll-out of e-government reform strategies at
337 the NIS.

338 16 Poor electricity supply and internet connectivity

339 A stable electricity supply and access to Internet connectivity are important ingredients for the successful roll-out
340 of e-government reform strategies. Electricity and the Internet connectivity are required to access information
341 and services online. Where these two basic infrastructures are not available or are available only to the few
342 because of the cost involved and the high level of poverty among the supposed e-service consumers, e-government
343 reforms would not be as successful as they should have been. The majority of the interviewees attributed the not
344 very successful implementation of egovernment reforms at the NIS to these twin problems of electricity supply
345 and the high cost of Internet connectivity. They observed that many of the NIS offices across the nation depend
346 on generators for power supply and the financial implications of doing so high. The cost of Internet subscription
347 is also high. These challenges are affecting the online service and information delivery at the NIS. One concern
348 expressed regarding power supply and internet connectivity was that:

349 Epileptic power supply is disrupting the success of e-government here in the Nigeria Immigration Service.
350 Irregular power supply is common in Nigeria with negative impacts on our ICT facilities. The service depends
351 on the generating sets as an alternative source of power supply to our ICT facilities. In addition, the cost of
352 internet subscription is also very high without government subsidy. The financial implications of paying for
353 internet subscription without subsidy and depending on generators as alternative source of power supply have
354 added to the costs of service delivery in Nigeria (Government official 01, 2021). i.

355 17 Global Journal of Management and Business Research

356 Many of the respondents noted that poor power supply and the high cost of internet connection has been a
357 challenged to the effective implementation of egovernment strategies of the NIS. The interviewees noted that
358 irregular power supply and the cost of internet subscription is affecting both the service providers and the service
359 consumers in Nigeria. This is the case because not every Nigerian has access to electricity and many cannot
360 afford to use generators as an alternative source of power supply. The overwhelming majority of Nigerians do not
361 also have access to the internet. Hence, even when information and services are available online, many people go
362 for the traditional method that requires physical contacts between service provider and service consumers. The
363 participants on the whole demonstrated that the combined impacts of lack of sufficient electricity supply and
364 access to the internet constitute a barrier to the success of e-government reforms at NIS.

365 18 Low ICT Skill, high rate of poverty and poor funding of 366 e-government initiatives

367 The Information and Communication Technology (ICT) education and skills have been identified by the majority
368 of the interviewees in this study as the basic requirement for the success of egovernment in Nigeria. But the
369 interviewees remarked that this basic infrastructure at best is grossly insufficient and in some places and among
370 some categories of individuals is completely lacking. The participants argued that this is one of the reasons why
371 e-government reforms have not been successful in the Nigeria Immigration Service. The respondents attributed
372 the low ICT skills among both the government employees and the general public to poverty. They observed that
373 the poverty rate has prevented many people who are willing from having ICT training and workshops within
374 and outside the country. They claimed that not all government employees at the NIS have ICT training and
375 education because the service cannot afford to pay the training fees for its entire staff to go for the basic ICT
376 training and workshops. Many of the interviewees claimed that the government budgetary allocation to the
377 Nigeria Immigration Service has always been low, and cannot meet all the financial requirements of egovernment
378 projects. In this regard, a respondent argued that:

379 The majority of the employees at the Nigeria Immigration Service do not have the required level of education
380 and training in ICT to successfully perform the task of e-service delivery. The few with the ICT knowledge are not
381 willing to give on the job training to those without the skills. And the organisation does not have enough money
382 to send every employee for ICT training either within or outside the country because of the size of its budget.
383 The few employees with ICT skills are being overwhelmed with huge tasks. This has been our predicament at the
384 Nigeria Immigration Service (Government official 01, 2021). This view was echoed by one of the policy experts
385 interviewed when he said that 'a low ICT skill among government employees and the target beneficiaries of their
386 e-services has been a threat to the success of e-government reforms in Nigeria. The low ICT education could be
387 linked to the high rate of poverty in the country'. The study reveals that there are employees who are willing to
388 go for ICT trainings to acquire the basic skills to meet the new requirements of their official responsibility but
389 cannot do so because of the fees involved and their financial status. There are individuals outside government
390 without ICT education. This category of individuals cannot benefit from eservices and e-information even when
391 such services are available for them online.

392 19 VI.

393 20 Conclusion

394 This paper used a single empirical case study to explore the dynamics of the transfer of e-government reform
395 strategies from the international arena to the Nigeria Immigration Service. The study answered questions related
396 to the origin, the exogenous causes of the transfer, the actors involved and the modalities used for the transfer.
397 The paper used a case study research design and qualitative methods of data collections to generate relevant
398 data from different research participants to answer the study's research questions.

399 The findings have significant implications for policy development in Nigeria and other developing countries
400 across Africa. As has been demonstrated by the study, we can say that while nation states strive for increase
401 efficiency and productivity, international pressure is the major cause of policy transfer from the international arena
402 to Nigeria. This is due to the Nigeria dependence on the global north for financial assistance, and technology
403 transfer. But local conditions are the determinants of the outcomes of the transfer of egovernment reforms
404 not the donors that enforced the transfer. Local factors and actors should be considered before the transfer of
405 western solutions to less developed countries across Africa. The availability of basic infrastructures, economic
406 and educational conditions etc. of the people must not be ignored in the transfer of solutions of western origin
407 to less developed countries in Africa. In addition, citizens' acceptance of reforms is important for the success
408 of policy transfer across Africa. This is the case because citizens are the potential consumers and the major
409 beneficiaries of policy transfer and public sector reforms across Africa. Thus, they should not be ignored in the
410 process of the transfer because they are among the important domestic policy actors that determine the outcomes
411 of policy transfer. Without their support in patronising the e-services and e-information, even if such services are
412 available, e-government reforms would not be as successful as they should have been in Nigeria. Consequently,
413 while donors in most cases are responsible for policy transfer and public sector reforms in LDCs, national factors
414 and actors are the main determinant of the effective roll-out of policy transfer.^{1 2}

¹© 2021 Global Journals

²Policy Transfer: An Analysis of the Implementation of E-Government Reform Strategies by the Nigeria Immigration Service

1

E-government Strategies	Machine Readable Passport (MRP)	E-passport	The internet and dedicated website
Places of Origin to Nigeria	UK	UK, Australia, New Zealand, Germany, France and the USA	UK, Canada, USA, South Korea, Bangladesh, Africa
Actors involved in the transfer	International Civil Aviation Organisation (ICAO) and	ICAO, EU, UKDFID, officials	World Bank, World Bank, EU, Korea
Officials of the Nigeria Immigration Service	NITDA, Federal Ministry of Communication and Nigeria Immigration Service	NITDA, Federal Ministry of Communication and Nigeria Immigration Service	Strategy, UKDFID, NITDA, Federal Communication Nigeria Immigration Service
Causes of the transfer	To replace non-MRP, stop identity theft, multiple acquisitions, improve national security and pressure from the ICAO	To improve national security, prevent multiple international prestige and leadership, pressure from the ICAO, and the need to implement Peoples Democratic Party (PDP) manifesto	The desire to improve efficiency and transparency to bring public service and information closer to the people, corrupt practices
Modalities for the transfer	Conferences and international pressure	Conferences, building, case study visits, conditions for board	Conferences, building formal education training in ICT

415 [Yin ()] *Case study research: Design and methods*, R K Yin . 2013. Sage publications.

416 [Yin ()] *Case study research: Design and methods 4th ed. Paper presented at the United States: Library of*
417 *Congress Cataloguing-in-Publication Data*, R K Yin . 2009.

418 [Swanborn ()] *Case study research: what, why and how?*, P Swanborn . 2010. Sage.

419 [Mccourt et al. ()] *Commitment to civil service reform in Swaziland: Institute for Development Policy and*
420 *Management*, W Mccourt , M U I F D Policy , Management . 2001. University of Manchester

421 [Nyundo ()] *EFFECT OF INFORMATION AND COMMUNICATIONS TECHNOLOGY SUPPORTED OP-*
422 *ERATIONS ON SERVICE QUALITY AT THE DEPARTMENT OF IMMIGRATION*, M A Nyundo . 2013.
423 KENYA. SCHOOL OF BUSINESS, UNIVERSITY OF NAIROBI.

424 [Therkildsen and Development ()] *Efficiency, accountability and implementation: public sector reform in*, O
425 Therkildsen
426 N. R. I. f. S. , U Development
427 N. R. I. f. S. . 2001. East and Southern Africa: United Nations Research Institute for Social Development

428 [Richards ()] 'Elite interviewing: Approaches and pitfalls'. D Richards . *Politics* 1996. 16 (3) p. .

429 [Olatokun and Abduldayan ()] *Evaluation of Sectoral Implementation of Nigerian National Information Tech-*
430 *nology (IT) Policy*, W M Olatokun , F J Abduldayan . 2014. (Available at SSRN 2523290)

431 [Halperin and Heath ()] S Halperin , O Heath . *Political research: methods and practical skills*, 2012. Oxford
432 University Press.

433 [Heeks ()] R Heeks . *Government in Africa: Promise and practice. Information polity*, 2002a. 7 p. .

434 [Heeks ()] *Information systems and developing countries: Failure, success, and local improvisations. The*
435 *information society*, R Heeks . 2002b. 18 p. .

436 [Tettey ()] 'Information technology and democratic participation in Africa'. W J Tettey . *Journal of Asian and*
437 *African Studies* 2001. 36 (1) p. .

438 [Dolowitz and Marsh ()] 'Learning from abroad: The role of policy transfer in contemporary policy-making'. D
439 P Dolowitz , D Marsh . *Governance* 2000. 13 (1) p. .

440 [Rose ()] *Lesson-drawing in public policy: A guide to learning across time and space*, R Rose . 1993. Cambridge
441 Univ Press. 91.

442 [Mkandawire and Soludo ()] P T Mkandawire , C C Soludo . *Our continent, our future: African perspectives on*
443 *structural adjustment: Idrc*, 1999.

444 [Gualini ()] *Multi-level governance and institutional change: The Europeanization of regional policy in Italy*, E
445 Gualini . 2004.

446 [Tambulasi ()] *Policy transfer and service delivery transformation in developing countries: the case of Malawi*
447 *health sector reforms*, R I C Tambulasi . 2011. University of Manchester

448 [Evans ()] *Policy transfer in global perspective*, M Evans . 2004. Gower Publishing, Ltd.

449 [Mccourt ()] 'Political commitment to reform: civil service reform in Swaziland'. W Mccourt . *World Development*
450 2003. (6) p. .

451 [Hague et al. ()] *Political science: A comparative introduction*, R Hague , M Harrop , J McCormick . 2016.
452 Palgrave Macmillan.

453 [Karyeija ()] *Public sector reforms in Africa: what lessons have we learnt? Paper presented at the Forum for*
454 *Development Studies*, G K Karyeija . 2012.

455 [King and Crewe ()] *The blunders of our governments*, A King , I Crewe . 2013. Oneworld Publications.

456 [Mccourt et al. ()] *The NPM agenda for service delivery: A suitable model for developing countries. The*
457 *internationalization of public management: Reinventing the Third World state*, W Mccourt , W Mccourt
458 , Minogue M Cheltenham . 2001. Edward Elgar. p. .

459 [Azeez et al. ()] *Threats to egovernment implementation in the civil service: Nigeria as a case study*, N A Azeez
460 , A P Abidoye , A O Adesina , K K Agbele , A Oyewole . 2012.

461 [Mundy and Musa ()] 'Towards a framework for egovernment development in nigeria'. D Mundy , B Musa .
462 *Electronic Journal of E-government* 2010. 8 (2) p. .

463 [Homburg ()] *Understanding E-government: Information systems in public administration*: Routledge, V
464 Homburg . 2008.

465 [Dolowitz and Marsh ()] 'Who learns what from whom: a review of the policy transfer literature'. D Dolowitz ,
466 D Marsh . *Political studies* 1996. 44 (2) p. .